## EXTERNAL EVALUATION REPORT

Imperial Valley College 380 Aten Road Imperial, CA 92251

This report represents the findings of the peer review team that visited Imperial Valley College from March 11 to March 14, 2019.

Roger W. Schultz, Ph.D. Team Chair

## Contents

Summary of Evaluation Report	5
Team Commendations	7
Team Recommendations	7
Introduction	9
Eligibility Requirements	11
Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies	12
Public Notification of an Evaluation Team Visit and Third Party Comment	12
Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement	13
Credits, Program Length, and Tuition	14
Transfer Policies	15
Distance Education and Correspondence Education	15
Student Complaints	16
Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials	17
Title IV Compliance	18
Standard I	20
I.A. Mission	20
I.B. Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness	21
I.C. Institutional Integrity	25
IIIC. Technology Resources	42
IVA. Decision-Making Roles and Processes	50
IVB. Chief Executive Officer	52
IVC. Governing Board	55
Quality Focus Essay	59

## Imperial Valley College Comprehensive Evaluation Visit

## **Team Roster**

Roger W. Schultz, Ph.D., Team Chair Mt. San Jacinto College Superintendent/President

Ms. Rebecca Teague, Team Assistant

Mt. San Jacinto College

Dean of Institutional Effectiveness, Planning and Grants/ALO

## **ACADEMIC MEMBERS**

Dr. Leandra Martin
Mission College
Vice President of Instruction

Mr. Vincent Piro Merced College Acting Dean/Professor of English

Dr. Sheila Pisa Moreno Valley College Professor Mathematics, Project Director Basic Skills Transformation Grant

Dr. Dulce Gray West Valley College Instructor of English and Women's Studies

Mr. Brian Greene Columbia College Librarian

## **ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBERS**

Mr. Mike Lee

Los Angeles Valley College

Vice President of Administrative Services

Dr. Elizabeth Martinez

Compton College Vice President of Student Services

Mr. Brian Murphy Butte College Director of Institutional Research

## **ACCJC STAFF LIAISON**

Dr. Stephanie Droker Senior Vice President

## **Summary of Evaluation Report**

INSTITUTION: Imperial Valley College
DATES OF VISIT: March 11-14, 2019
TEAM CHAIR: Dr. Roger W. Schultz

An 11-member accreditation team visited Imperial Valley College (IVC) on Monday, March 11, 2019 to Thursday, March 14, 2019, for the purpose of determining whether the College continues to meet Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies, and U.S. Department of Education (USDE) regulations. The team evaluated how well IVC is achieving its stated purpose, provided commendations and recommendations for institutional improvement related to the Standards, and submitted recommendations to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) regarding the accredited status of the College.

In preparation for the visit, the team chair reviewed the training materials with the co-facilitators of ACCJC's spring 2019 Team Chair training. On January 31, 2019, the team chair conducted a pre-visit to IVC's campus. During the visit, the chair and team assistant met with college leadership and key personnel involved in the self-evaluation preparation process. The entire evaluation team attended ACCJC's Team Training Workshop on February 6, 2019.

The evaluation team received IVC's Institutional Self-Evaluation Report (ISER) and related evidence several weeks prior to the site visit. Team members found that the ISER outlined the processes used to draft the report, the Eligibility Requirements, Commission Standards and Policies, as well as the activities related to the college's ongoing quality improvement. The ISER also contained a Quality Focus Essay that outlined the approach the college would use to address their goal of improved student completion. Prior to arriving for the visit team members began drafting their respective sections of the report. The team confirmed that the ISER was developed through broad participation of the college community and constituent groups.

Although the team appreciated the brevity of the report, the team did express some frustration at the lack of inclusion and embedding of evidence and practices to validate the assertions made in the report to address the standards. A more robust inventory and linking of evidence to the ISER would have enhanced and expedited the review process of the team, and would have provided a more accurate representation of the comprehensive progress the college has made to serve students and meet the standards.

The team arrived the day before the visit on Sunday, March 10, 2019. The team had an initial team meeting that evening to discuss the updated visit schedule, then to review the report, discuss evidence and preliminary findings, any concerns, to identify any evidence still needed, as well as any additional interviews of staff.

On Monday, March 11, 2019, the team arrived on campus and gathered for an additional team meeting in the team room prior to taking a campus tour, which included instructional areas, the library and tutoring center, professional development facilities, as well as student support service areas. The campus tour was followed by an opening session and brief reception. The team then commenced review of the evidence and conducted scheduled interviews with faculty and staff.

During the visit, the team conducted numerous individual and group interviews with students, faculty, staff, Board, and community members. In addition, the college hosted two open forums for the team- on March 11<sup>th</sup> during the day, and another on March 12<sup>th</sup> in the early evening. The forums were well attended with campus staff as well as community members. Between the two forums there were approximately 80 people in attendance to provide comments and perspectives about the college.

In the evenings, the team continued to meet and share observations, findings, and began drafting their respective contributions to the report, as well as formulating recommendations and areas for commendation. On the final night the team collectively reviewed each section of the draft report and formalized their recommendations, commendations and areas the team wished to give recognition to within the report.

The next morning the team chair met with the Superintendent/President immediately prior to the campus exit meeting, which took place at 10:30 a.m. in the college center.

Interactions with college staff were always positive. IVC staff were friendly, timely, and responsive to requests for additional evidence, materials, meetings, security, and technology issues. Snacks, beverages, meals, and even supplies were well planned and organized so that the team could be effective and focus on the site visit and evaluation. IVC also provided three golf carts so team members could easily get to interviews and meetings that were some distance from the team room. The team rooms at both the college and the hotel were equipped with technology and other supplies to support the work of the team. Overall, the team found the college was well-prepared for the visit and was shown a great deal of genuine hospitality from throughout the campus community.

The team found that with the exception of two recommendations, the College satisfies the standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies and USDE regulations. In addition, the team identified three other areas as recommendations to improve institutional quality and effectiveness. The evaluation team did find several areas where it noted in the report or as a formal commendation for efforts that were found to exceed the standards or that were exemplary and noteworthy.

## Major Findings and Recommendations of the 2019 External Evaluation Team

#### **Team Commendations**

<u>Commendation 1</u>: The team commends the College for its comprehensive and reliable services to students regardless of service location or delivery of services. This was exemplified by the implementation and tremendous success of students participating in its Inside Out Program for incarcerated students, in addition to programs that connect individuals to the college such as the Health Center and the IVC Kitchen with the Developing Garden. (II.C.3)

<u>Commendation 2</u>: The team commends the College for establishing the Teaching and Learning Center (TLC), as well as the associated faculty and staff that have created an impressive resource-rich environment to nurture faculty innovation in pursuit of improved student learning outcomes in and out of the classroom. (III.C.4)

<u>Commendation 3</u>: The team commends the College for its commitment to students and their success and the transformation of the community as a whole through higher education. There is an organizational culture that is palpable of focusing on students that permeates the faculty, staff and administration. The community also expresses how strongly they feel about the value and role the college plays in being a beacon of hope and change in the region. (IV.A.1, IV.A.5; IV.B.6)

#### **Team Recommendations**

#### **Recommendations to Meet Standards:**

#### Recommendation 1:

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college engage in a robust learning outcomes assessment process that is consistent and comprehensive to improve all programs and services. (I.B.2, II.A.3, II.B.3, II.C.1, II.C.2)

## Recommendation 2:

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college improve the evaluation of processes and systems that are currently in place, and ensure they are more systematic and routine. (I.B.7, I.B.9)

## **Recommendations to Improve Quality:**

## Recommendation 3:

In order to improve institutional effectiveness the team recommends the college document its review process to ensure accuracy, clarity, and integrity of information provided to the public and community. (I.C.1)

## Recommendation 4:

In order to improve institutional effectiveness the team recommends the college follow its performance evaluation cycle and process for all employees. (III.A.5)

## Recommendation 5:

In order to improve institutional effectiveness the team recommends the college improve the evaluation and assessment of the professional development efforts. (III.A.14)

#### Introduction

Imperial Valley College (IVC) was formed in 1962 in the rural area of Imperial County just outside of El Centro. The College has one 160-acre campus a few miles away from the population centers of El Centro, Imperial, Calexico, Brawly and a number of other communities. The campus is located in the center of the county adjacent to Highway 111, and therefore is within reasonable commuting distance of most of the communities it serves. The district encompasses more than 4,600 square miles of Imperial County.

The student population is reflective of the community that the college serves. During the 2017-18 academic year the college was comprised of 90.9% Hispanic, 4.3% White, 0.6% Asian and 1.55% African-American. Students that reported themselves as more than one racial/ethnic group comprised 0.5% of the student population. IVC also has a number of outreach programs that serves the local prison populations. The total population of the county is approximately 180,000 with a median age of 32.2 and median household income of \$42,560. There is a 24.1% poverty rate in the county.

Although most of the country is experiencing low unemployment (~4%), Imperial County has an unemployment rate near 20%. Although better than the 30%+ experienced by Imperial County during the great recession, the region had been referred to as the "Capital of the Great Recession". The college acts as the region's main workforce development organization as the area transitions to a more diverse employment base. The region continues to be dominated by agriculture, but other emerging sectors include government, public service, and healthcare.

The college has a robust array of curriculum that allows students to pursue transfer options, as well as local degree and certificate programs that lead to careers in the local workforce. The college does have a limited distance education program and offered approximately 70 online courses in spring 2018. The college transitioned to the Canvas learning management system in fall 2016.

The college also provides a comprehensive set of outreach and support services to the students and community. These services range from the traditional counseling and tutoring support, to the more extended ones that address even more basic needs such as food insecurities with the IVC Kitchen, or the mental health needs through the Health Center.

IVC is an attractive and inviting campus that boasts an array of comprehensive instructional, support, and administrative facilities. The campus has a blend of old and new buildings, complete with cutting edge technology to facilitate and support student learning in and out of the classroom. Notable is the beautifully designed 2700 building in the center of campus. The building is a 70,000 square foot, two story, classroom and laboratory building that is LEED Silver certified, the first in the county at the time of its opening in 2010. In addition, there are

two new career education buildings to support technology and public service programs, complete with high-tech simulation stations that have dramatically improved student learning and pass rates on some licensing exams.

IVC has a long tradition of serving its community through passion, dedication and innovation of staff, its leadership team and Board of Trustees. Throughout the campus and community there is a mutual respect and affection between the students and the institution. The pride of IVC is visibly palpable given its ability to transform the lives of those in the community it serves. Many of the staff, including the superintendent/president and several board members are alumni of the college. IVC is a unique and special institution that embodies what it means to be a "community" college.

## **Eligibility Requirements**

## 1. Authority

The team confirmed that IVC is a comprehensive two-year community college in a single college district authorized to operate as a postsecondary degree-granting educational institution by the State of California, the Board of Governors of the California Community College System, and the Governing Board of Imperial Valley College. The institution has maintained continuous accreditation by ACCJC since its inception in 1962.

**Conclusion:** The College meets ER 1.

## 2. Operational Status

The College provides extensive data, detailing student enrollment showing steady growth in student headcount and in course and program fill rates. Program reviews for degree-granting programs provide further documentation of students' active enrollment and completion rates in certificates and programs.

**Conclusion:** The College meets ER 2.

## 3. Degrees

The team confirmed that a substantial proportion of IVC's educational offerings are programs that lead to degrees, many of which are two years in length. A significant number of students at IVC are enrolled in such programs.

**Conclusion:** The College meets ER 3.

## 4. Chief Executive Officer

The team confirmed that IVC has a CEO who has been appointed by the Board, who has the authority to administer Board policies, and whose full-time responsibility is to the institution. This CEO does not serve as the chair of the Governing Board.

**Conclusion:** The College meets ER 4.

## 5. Financial Accountability

The team confirmed that IVC engages a qualified external auditor to conduct audits of all financial records. All audits are certified and all explanations of findings are documented appropriately. Resulting audit reports are made available.

**Conclusion:** The College meets ER 5.

# **Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies**

The evaluation items detailed in this Checklist are those which fall specifically under federal regulations and related Commission policies, beyond what is articulated in the Accreditation Standards; other evaluation items under ACCJC standards may address the same or similar subject matter. The peer review team evaluated the institution's compliance with Standards as well as the specific Checklist elements from federal regulations and related Commission policies noted here.

## <u>Public Notification of an Evaluation Team Visit and Third Party Comment</u> Evaluation Items:

X	The institution has made an appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comment in advance of a comprehensive evaluation visit.
×	The institution cooperates with the evaluation team in any necessary follow-up related to the third party comment.
×	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions</i> as to third party comment.

[Regulation citation: 602.23(b).]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

**Narrative:** IVC posted information and a link to the ACCJC third-party comments form on the college website in preparation for the accreditation site visit. Information about open forums also was posted on the website. The public was notified of the site visit and associated open forums through the local newspaper.

## **Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement**

## **Evaluation Items:**

X	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance across the institution, and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. Course completion is included as one of these elements of student achievement. Other elements of student achievement performance for measurement have been determined as appropriate to the institution's mission. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
X	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance within each instructional program, and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. The defined elements include, but are not limited to, job placement rates for program completers, and for programs in fields where licensure is required, the licensure examination passage rates for program completers. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
X	The institution-set standards for programs and across the institution are relevant to guide self-evaluation and institutional improvement; the defined elements and expected performance levels are appropriate within higher education; the results are reported regularly across the campus; and the definition of elements and results are used in program-level and institution-wide planning to evaluate how well the institution fulfills its mission, to determine needed changes, to allocating resources, and to make improvements. (Standard I.B.3, Standard I.B.9)
×	The institution analyzes its performance as to the institution-set standards and as to student achievement, and takes appropriate measures in areas where its performance is not at the expected level. (Standard I.B.4)

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(i); 602.17(f); 602.19 (a-e).]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

**Narrative:** Imperial Valley College sets institution-set standards for student performance. These standards are shared and discussed widely through governance committees.

## Credits, Program Length, and Tuition

#### **Evaluation Items:**

×	Credit hour assignments and degree program lengths are within the range of good practice in higher education (in policy and procedure). (Standard II.A.9)
×	The assignment of credit hours and degree program lengths is verified by the institution, and is reliable and accurate across classroom based courses, laboratory classes, distance education classes, and for courses that involve clinical practice (if applicable to the institution). (Standard II.A.9)
⊠	Tuition is consistent across degree programs (or there is a rational basis for any program-specific tuition). (Standard I.C.2)
⊠	Any clock hour conversions to credit hours adhere to the Department of Education's conversion formula, both in policy and procedure, and in practice. (Standard II.A.9)
☒	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits</i> .

[Regulation citations: 600.2 (definition of credit hour); 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.24(e), (f); 668.2; 668.9.]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative: Imperial Valley College awards academic credits based on generally accepted practices for degree-granting institutions of higher education. The Course Outlines of Record, degrees, and certificates are reviewed by the Curriculum Committee, under the direction of the Academic Senate, to ensure that the credit hours and units comply with the regulations set forth in the Program and Course Approval Handbook. Imperial Valley College has in place written policies and procedures for determining a credit hour that meets USED and commonly accepted academic expectations. The College does not offer clock-hour based courses. Tuition is clear and consistent across all degree programs.

## **Transfer Policies**

## **Evaluation Items:**

×	Transfer policies are appropriately disclosed to students and to the public. (Standard II.A.10)
×	Policies contain information about the criteria the institution uses to accept credits for transfer. (Standard II.A.10)
×	The institution complies with the Commission <i>Policy on Transfer of Credit</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.17(a)(3); 602.24(e); 668.43(a)(ii).]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

**Narrative:** Imperial Valley College policies and information regarding transfer are available to students on the College website and in the catalog. To evaluate and grant transfer credit, college faculty, counselors, students, and staff use a common articulation system (ASSIST) to determine course-to-course articulation for general education and major requirements. When appropriate, course descriptions and Course Outlines of Record are reviewed to determine where a course is equivalent.

## **Distance Education and Correspondence Education**

## **Evaluation Items:**

For Distance Education:	
×	The institution demonstrates regular and substantive interaction between students and the instructor.
×	The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for distance education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
×	The institution verifies that the student who registers in a distance education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.
×	The technology infrastructure is sufficient to maintain and sustain the distance education and correspondence education offerings. (Standard III.C.1)

The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education*.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(iv), (vi); 602.17(g); 668.38.]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the Institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.
	The college does not offer Distance Education or Correspondence Education.

**Narrative:** Imperial Valley College provided evidence that it has policies and procedures for classifying a course as distance education and that these policies and procedures are applied on a consistent basis. Distance education courses follow the same course outline of record as face-to-face classes and are required to address regular, effective, and substantive contact. Student identity is verified through secure authentication. Technology infrastructure is sufficient to support distance education students.

## **Student Complaints**

## **Evaluation Items:**

×	The institution has clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, and the current policies and procedures are accessible to students in the college catalog and online.
×	The student complaint files for the previous seven years (since the last comprehensive evaluation) are available; the files demonstrate accurate implementation of the complaint policies and procedures.
⊠	The team analysis of the student complaint files identifies any issues that may be indicative of the institution's noncompliance with any Accreditation Standards.
X	The institution posts on its website the names of associations, agencies and governmental bodies that accredit, approve, or license the institution and any of its programs, and provides contact information for filing complaints with such entities. (Standard I.C.1)
×	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Representation</i> of Accredited Status and the Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(ix); 668.43.]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

**Narrative:** Imperial Valley College has clear procedures for student complaints. Policies and procedures are posted online and in the College Catalog. The College maintains appropriate historical records of student complaint files. The names and contact information for accrediting bodies is posted on the College website. Evidence indicates that the College complies with the *Policy on Representation of Accredited Status* and the *Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions*.

## **Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials**

#### **Evaluation Items:**

×	The institution provides accurate, timely (current), and appropriately detailed information to students and the public about its programs, locations, and policies. (Standard I.C.2)
×	The institution complies with the Commission <i>Policy on Institutional Advertising,</i> Student Recruitment, and Policy on Representation of Accredited Status.
×	The institution provides required information concerning its accredited status.(Standard I.C.12)

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1))(vii); 668.6.]

## **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

**Narrative:** Imperial Valley College, through its catalog and website, provides accurate, timely and appropriately detailed information to students and the public about its programs, locations, and policies. The College complies with the Commission *Policy on Institutional Advertising*, *Student Recruitment and Representation of Accredited Status* by ensuring all publications and advertising are accurate and the term "accredited" is in compliance with the ACCJC policy. Finally, the College lists all required information and program accreditors as described in the section on Student Complaints.

## **Title IV Compliance**

## **Evaluation Items:**

×	The institution has presented evidence on the required components of the Title IV Program, including findings from any audits and program or other review activities by the USDE. (Standard III.D.15)
×	If applicable, the institution has addressed any issues raised by the USDE as to financial responsibility requirements, program record-keeping, etc. If issues were not timely addressed, the institution demonstrates it has the fiscal and administrative capacity to timely address issues in the future and to retain compliance with Title IV program requirements. (Standard III.D.15)
×	If applicable, the institution's student loan default rates are within the acceptable range defined by the USDE. Remedial efforts have been undertaken when default rates near or meet a level outside the acceptable range. (Standard III.D.15)
×	If applicable, contractual relationships of the institution to offer or receive educational, library, and support services meet the Accreditation Standards and have been approved by the Commission through substantive change if required. (Standard III.D.16)
×	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations</i> and the <i>Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(v); 602.16(a)(1)(x); 602.19(b); 668.5; 668.15; 668.16; 668.71 et seq.]

## **Conclusion Check-Off:**

×	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.

	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does
	not meet the Commission's requirements.

**Narrative:** The U.S. Department of Education conducted a review of Imperial Valley College's Title IV program and the review resulted in no findings. The student loan default rates are acceptable. All contractual obligations engaged by the institution are controlled by *Board Policy* 6340. The College is in compliance with Title IV.

#### Standard I

## Mission, Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness

#### I.A. Mission

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College demonstrates its commitment to its students through its mission, which articulates its educational opportunities available based on identified student and community needs. Through an extensive program review, planning and resource allocation cycle, the College aligns its programs, services and resources toward its mission and the communities it serves. The mission is reviewed on a regular cycle, updated, approved by the Board of Trustees, and communicated widely.

## **Findings and Evidence:**

The Imperial Valley College (IVC) mission statement describes the institution's broad educational purposes, its intended student population, the types of degrees and other credentials it offers, and its commitment to student learning and student achievement. The team verified that the mission articulates the College's commitment providing a rigorous and supportive learning environment. The mission statement, along with College Vision, Values and Goals reflects the population the College serves and the challenges it aims to address. IVC seeks to "foster excellence in education that challenges students of every background to develop their intellect, character, and abilities; to assist students in achieving their educational and career goals; and to be responsive to the greater community". (I.A.1)

The team confirmed the College uses data to determine how effectively it is accomplishing its mission. Through the IVC Strategic Educational Master Plan, the College uses mission-related data to set institutional priorities and improve practices and processes towards meeting its mission. The Strategic Educational Master Plan organizes and features data on area demographics, employment, completion rates, and student success rates, to name a few. The College's visioning process demonstrated the collection of feedback from various stakeholders in the community and used the feedback to make changes and quality improvements. The Strategic Educational Master Plan uses the overarching goals embodied in the mission and supporting documents as the foundation for College strategy and priorities development. The Program Review Handbook also illustrates that trends in enrollment, demographics, success, and labor market are used in the College's program review process. (I.A.2)

The Imperial Valley College mission statement provides the foundation for the Strategic Educational Master Plan, which, in turn, justifies academic program, student services, and

support unit objectives and resource allocations. The team confirmed that the College's programs and services are aligned with its mission. The institutional goals developed in the Strategic Educational Master Plan are referenced by the program review process. Program reviews are the mechanism by which programs and business units communicate their goals, objectives, performance, and resource requirements to College leadership, participatory governance, and College stakeholders. (I.A.3)

In addition to physical postings on its campuses, the team substantiated that IVC's mission is published in the College Catalog and schedule, Strategic Educational Master Plan, Student Handbook, and Faculty Handbook, all of which are found on the College website. The team confirmed that the College is adhering to Board Policy 1200 that defines the mission. Although the ISER indicates that the mission is scheduled to be evaluated every three years; a process and timeline evidenced in administrative procedures was unable to be located. The team suggests that the college document this process. However, governing board agendas and minutes document that the mission was reviewed in 2012 and 2015 respectively. (I.A.4)

## **Conclusions:**

The College meets the standard.

## I.B. Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College (IVC) demonstrates a sustained, substantive, and collegial dialog about student outcomes, student equity, academic quality, institutional effectiveness, and continuous improvement of student learning and achievement. This dialog is supported by data on learning outcomes, learning and support services, and the College's institution-set standards for student achievement. The College uses these data and organizes its institutional processes to support student learning and student achievement. Further, Imperial Valley College assesses accomplishment of its mission through annual and comprehensive program review processes and the monitoring of progress toward its institutional goals and objectives. Appropriate data are disaggregated for analysis by program type, mode of delivery, and subpopulations of its student body.

## Findings and Evidence:

The team confirmed that Imperial Valley College demonstrates a sustained, substantive, and collegial dialog about student outcomes, student equity, academic quality, institutional effectiveness, and continuous improvement of student learning and achievement. The team

found that the College's "deeply-rooted culture of dialog" is evidenced through its annual program review process, and Strategic Educational Master Plan (SEMP). The team verified that dialog is College-wide, facilitated by the College's participatory governance process that includes the SEMP Committee and other core committees. Through interviews and review of documentation, the team found that committees are chaired, at a minimum, by a faculty and administrative representative. In addition, some committees have classified chairs. Integration among these constituency groups greatly enhances the culture of dialog. Further, the team was provided evidence of dialog that engaged students and the community as part of the College's efforts to meet the needs of its students and toward continuous improvement of student learning and achievement. (I.B.1)

The team confirmed that Imperial Valley College defines and assesses student learning outcomes for most instructional programs and student and learning support services. The team reviewed evidence to support that PLOs and SLOs are located in CurriQnet and in the College catalog. PLOs are aligned with course outlines. ILOs were indirectly assessed in a student survey in spring 2018. Through interviews and review of evidence, the team found that IVC has a process for tracking progress on assessment of learning outcomes; however, the team noted that work on learning assessment is inconsistent across all departments. For example, 68 courses completed SLO assessment in 2015-2016, 91 in 2016-2017, but only 19 in 2017-2018. There are SAOs developed for 16 areas, including Student Services, the library, Institutional Research, and Student Affairs. While the team found that learning outcomes have been developed and a plan for their assessment exists they are not fully incorporated consistently within the program review process. IVC has established program review processes for regularly evaluating the quality of services and the area outcomes so that it advances student learning, the College mission, and are effective regardless of location or means of delivery. Even though all areas are completing program review, integration of learning outcome assessment is not systematically incorporated into the program review process. (I.B.2)

The team verified that the College has established institution-set standards (ISS) for student achievement in several key areas that are appropriate to its mission. Each metric includes both minimum and aspirational goals, and the team confirmed that all are assessed in pursuit of continuous improvement. The institution set standards are published and readily accessible on the College's website. (I.B.3)

The team noted that there is a strong connection between the use of achievement data and institutional processes. The team reviewed the College's Strategic Educational Master Plan, which uses success rates and other data, such as data collected from Banner, for planning purposes. The team observed that discipline and service units receive data from Institutional Research that disaggregates success by various groups, and the program review includes a program health analysis based on this information. The College has been using SPOL, an online

system, that integrates program review and budget allocation since 2013, but the team observed that a parallel system is being used for SLO assessment. The team felt that these parallel processes resulted in little connection between the collection of assessment data and program review and that learning outcomes were being under-utilized in institutional processes. (I.B.4)

The team found that Imperial Valley College assesses accomplishment of its mission and evaluates student achievement and learning outcomes through its annual and comprehensive program review processes. Through interviews and evidence, the team determined that program review is integral to the College's culture of dialog, planning processes, and assessment of student learning and achievement. The team verified that institutional data are disaggregated by program type and other relevant sub-populations of the student body for analysis and inclusion in the program review processes. (I.B.5)

The team verified that the College disaggregates and analyzes student access data, completion and transfer rates, and basic skills math/English learning outcomes for sub-populations of students. These data are incorporated into the program review process and reported in the College's Student Equity Plan and Integrated Plan. The team reviewed examples and evidence that when the College identifies performance gaps, it implements strategies that may include allocation or reallocation of human, fiscal, and other resources, to mitigate those gaps and, later, evaluates the efficacy of those strategies. The College's 2015 Student Equity report targets four groups as disproportionately impacted (Foster youth, disabled students, male students (especially athletes) and veterans) and created plans to address these equity gaps. In the 2017-2019 Integrated Plan, the College reported that it has allocated funds, evaluated results and is on track in meeting goals for improvement in the following areas:

- tutorial services and counseling for DSPS students
- Professional development for ESL faculty and embedded tutoring and a Winter Bridge for students in ESL classes
- Increased services for veterans
- Supplemental instruction program for student athletes (I.B.6)

The team confirmed that the College is engaging in evaluation through its comprehensive program review processes as well as through the bylaws for the Strategic Educational Master Plan Committee that includes a review, evaluation and revision of the master plan on an annual basis. However, the team noted, due to the lack of evidence, IVC does not engage in regular evaluation of all policies and practices across all areas of the institution. Strategies are implemented to address performance gaps and evaluated through program review; however the College does not have systems in place to regularly evaluate its policies and practices to assure their effectiveness in supporting academic quality and accomplishment of the mission. For example, documentation and evidence is limited to support that revisions and evaluation of the actual program review process take place and the timeline for this specific evaluation effort.

Additionally, the team confirmed that policies have been established and are followed for development and review of Board policies, however, there are no formalized procedures that outline how policies or other governance structures should be evaluated. The team found that the budgetary process is outlined, but there is no evidence that there is an evaluation of this process and that it is being performed on a regular basis. The team suggests the College should improve the evaluation of processes and systems that are currently in place, and ensure they are more systematic and routine. (I.B.7)

The team validated that IVC broadly communicates the results of its assessment and program review evaluation activities through its online SPOL system. Data are used in program review and discussed in various venues as the College develops a shared understanding of its strengths and weaknesses. Program review documents are regularly shared with the Strategic Educational Master Plan committee to ensure that requests support existing plans. Data is broadly communicated through the College's data dashboard which allows access to enrollment, FTES, and fill rates. This is evidenced and expressed as appropriate priorities in the College's Strategic Educational Master Plan. (I.B.8)

The team verified that the College's Strategic Educational Master Plan and program review processes enable the College to reflect on progress towards strategic goals and facilitate the College's efforts towards accomplishment of its mission and improvement of institutional effectiveness and academic quality. The team confirmed that Imperial Valley College engages in an annual evaluation process through the Program Review process; however, continuous, broad based, and systematic evaluation and planning related to institutional processes, policies, practices, services and programs is somewhat limited and inconsistent. The team suggests the College should consider improving the evaluation of processes and systems that are currently in place, and ensure they are more systematic and routine. (I.B.9)

#### **Conclusions:**

The College meets the standard except for I.B.2., I.B.7 and I.B.9

## **Recommendations to Meet Standards:**

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college engage in a robust learning outcomes assessment process that is consistent and comprehensive to improve all programs and services. (I.B.2, II.B.3, II.C.1, II.C.2)

#### **Recommendation to Meet Standards:**

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college improve the evaluation of processes and systems that are currently in place, and ensure they are more systematic and routine. (I.B.7, I.B.9)

## I.C. Institutional Integrity

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College (IVC) demonstrates institutional integrity through its commitment to assure the clarity, accuracy, and integrity of information provided to the College community and the public. The College publishes its mission statement, learning outcomes, student achievement outcomes, educational programs, student support services, and accredited status with all of its accreditors on its website and in the catalog. In addition, the College uses social media and internal newsletters and communications to disseminate information and learning outcomes data to students and the public. Program review information as well as information about fees, college and academic policies, and procedures are available to the College community and the public on its website.

## **Findings and Evidence:**

The team reviewed evidence demonstrating that Imperial Valley College communicates information about its mission, vision, values, strategic plan, learning outcomes, educational programs, student support services, and accredited status through a variety of means, including the College website as well as in printed materials. Although the evidence indicated that the information communicated by the College was clear and accurate, the team was unable to identify or locate documentation of a systematic review process. The College public information and marketing efforts are currently maintained by a professional expert. The College has plans through organizational restructuring and staff prioritizations to hire a permanent public information and marketing staff member to further ensure practices and procedures exist to ensure accuracy, clarity, and integrity of information provided to the public and community. (I.C.1)

Through an extensive review of the evidence, the team verified that the College provides both print (as requested) and online catalogs for students with precise, accurate, and current information on all facts, requirements, policies, and procedures. The College updates the catalog annually and regularly posts to the website. (I.C.2)

The team confirmed that the College publishes a data dashboard that is accessible to the public on the College's website. The team found that this site provides a variety of reports, including the Chancellor's Office Scorecard, that help students and the public access student learning and achievement data to enhance communication and transparency. Additionally, data reports focused on student achievement specific to feeder high schools are prepared and distributed. Currently, the student learning outcomes assessment reports are not available to the public, unless requested through the SPOL system. (I.C.3)

The team reviewed evidence to verify that the College describes the purpose, content, course requirements, and expected learning outcomes for its certificates and degrees in the printed and online catalogs and in the degrees and certificates section of the College's website. Course sequences, including units are also included in these descriptions. (I.C.4)

Imperial Valley College regularly reviews its policies, procedures and publications to assure integrity related to its mission, programs and services. Board Policy (BP) 2410 outlines a three-year cycle for reviewing Board policies and administrative procedures. The College also subscribes to the Community College League of California (CCLC) which provides recommended updates that are reviewed by the President's Cabinet before being routed to appropriate areas on campus for internal review. Recommended updates are reviewed and approved by the governing board. (I.C.5)

The team found that the institution accurately informs current and prospective students of the total cost of education through the College catalog. The catalog describes costs for admissions, fees and other financial obligations (such as parking fees). Costs of textbooks are found at the College bookstore website or in WebSTAR. The College also provides information to students on applying for financial aid. (I.C.6)

Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 4030 regarding academic freedom guides the institution in assuring institutional and academic integrity. The policy governs faculty in the classroom, research, and publications by assuring an atmosphere where freedom of inquiry and information, and knowledge dissemination occurs for all. The policy and procedure are available on the College website and in the College catalog. (I.C.7)

The institution establishes policies and procedures that promote honesty, responsibility, and academic integrity are provided for all IVC board members, staff, and students. The College has an Institutional Code of Ethics for all IVC employees, and the Board of Trustees aspires to adhere to a Board policy that contains a code of ethics. Board Policy 2715, enumerates protocols for addressing board member violations of ethics policies. Faculty integrity is declared in the faculty handbook. The Student Code of Conduct is published in the Student Handbook, and is also included in the catalog, in orientation, and on many syllabi. (I.C.8)

BP 4030, Academic Freedom, is published in the Faculty Handbook and College Catalog and outlines the expectation that faculty distinguish between personal conviction and professionally accepted views in a discipline. The Course Outline of Record helps assure information is presented fairly and objectively. Classroom and teaching observations, student evaluations, and peer and administrative reviews validate that faculty conform to the policy. (I.C.9)

While IVC has policies in place related to academic freedom, standards of behavior, and professional ethics, the College is an open access public institution that does not require conformity to codes of conduct that seek to instill specific beliefs or world views. (I.C.10)

Imperial Valley College does not operate in a foreign location, therefore, Standard I.C.11 is not applicable. (I.C.11)

Board Policy 3200, Accreditation, serves as the guide for the College in complying with Eligibility Requirements, Accreditation Standards, Commission policies and guidelines, requirements for public disclosure, institutional reporting, team visits, and prior approval of substantive changes. The College discloses all information required by the Commission on its accreditation webpage. The team confirmed correspondence with ACCJC and that accreditation documents were readily accessible on the College website. (I.C.12)

Imperial Valley College demonstrates honesty and integrity in its relationships with external agencies including ACCJC. College reporting to all of its accrediting agencies is consistent, timely and accurate. The College uses its website, catalog, newsletter, and press releases to communicate any changes in accreditation status to the Commission, students and the public. The College also communicates information to faculty and students through email and Board of Trustee meetings. (I.C.13)

The College's commitment to ensuring the high quality education noted in its mission statement is defined by its Board policies and administrative procedures. Financial audit statements show the College is committed to the betterment of its students rather than generating financial returns. The College's planning processes also show its commitment to student achievement and learning and independence from external agencies. (I.C.14)

#### **Conclusions:**

The College meets standard and related Eligibility Requirements.

#### **Recommendation:**

In order to improve institutional effectiveness the team recommends the college document its review process to ensure accuracy, clarity, and integrity of information provided to the public and community. (I.C.1)

# Standard II Student Learning Programs and Support Services

## **Standard II.A Instructional Programs**

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College offers a range of curriculum including pre-collegial, collegial, career education and community education courses and programs to support the interests and needs of their diverse student population. Courses are available in face-to-face, hybrid, or fully online modalities, and one program is expected to be available fully online in the near future. The College has a robust Curriculum Committee that regularly reviews and approves pre-collegial, collegial and career education courses and programs. The district adheres to the appropriate Board Policies and Administrative Procedures and the curriculum is appropriate to higher education.

There are concerns regarding the Student Learning Assessment process and its integration into the planning and resource allocation processes. The Student Learning Outcomes do not inform the program review process.

## **Evidence and Findings:**

All instructional programs including pre-collegiate, collegiate, career-technical, and community education, whether face-to-face, hybrid, or fully online, are offered in fields consistent with the mission of Imperial Valley College. The student learning outcomes and the program learning outcomes are identified in the course and program outline of record and are appropriate given the college's mission. Courses and programs offered result in the achievement of degrees, certificates, employment and transfer to other higher education programs. The College has expected student learning outcomes as part of their program description. (II.A.1)

The College has a robust curriculum review process, including a thorough review of distance education courses, that ensures the content and methods of instruction meet generally accepted academic standards and expectations. The College is in the process of implementing an improved process for systematically evaluating and tracking student learning outcomes. The College has a separate, but closely related program review process for evaluating programs using student completion and success data. Program reviews are scheduled on a regular three-year cycle and are used to inform resource requests; however, the current program review process is not consistently informed by Student Learning Outcome assessment results. Although IVC has a comprehensive program review process, the team found challenges in determining the scale of integration of assessment results for improving the quality of academic programs and services.

The team suggests that the College continue to strengthen the outcomes assessment process integration with program review to ensure ongoing use of data is used to make improvements in programs and services and appropriate resource allocations. (II.A.2)

Imperial Valley College has officially approved current course outlines that include student learning outcomes and the SLO Director has developed a process and forms to assist faculty with assessing course level and program level outcomes. In every class section, students receive a course syllabus that includes learning outcomes; many of these outlines are placed on the College's syllabi website. However, spreadsheets on the Canvas SLO website do not document consistent and comprehensive SLO assessment.

The College's syllabi website contains current syllabi with course learning outcomes, which are linked to Institutional Student Learning Outcomes. They are readily accessible to students both taking and interested in taking a course. However, there is a lack of consistency as different SLOs appear on different syllabi for the same course. The team suggests the College create a comprehensive process to ensure alignment with the Course Outline of Record. (II.A.3)

Imperial Valley College offers pre-collegiate curriculum and clearly distinguishes it from the college-level curriculum. This distinction is apparent in their course numbering system, which can be seen in the College Catalog and class schedules. To assure the distinction and alignment between pre-collegiate level courses and college-level curriculum, the College's Curriculum Committee and Board of Trustees reviews and approves all Course Outlines of Record. (II.A.4)

Imperial Valley College has degrees and programs that follow practices common to American higher education, including appropriate length, breadth, depth, rigor, course sequencing, time to completion, and synthesis of learning. The College's Curriculum Committee ensures that minimum degree requirements are 60 semester credits or equivalent at the associate level and 120 credits. Students can find course and program expectations, including time to completion, length, and course sequencing in the College Catalog and Schedule of Classes. Board Policy 4020 and Administrative Procedure 4020 codify these processes so that they are followed consistently. The College's Guided Pathways Committee is working to make these expectations clearer to students so that they can complete programs and achieve degrees in a more timely fashion. (II.A.5)

Through its enrollment management process, Imperial Valley College schedules courses in a manner that allows students to complete certificate and degree programs in accordance with established expectations in higher education. IVC's Strategic Enrollment Management process asks faculty and departments for "Utilization of two-year plans for each program in the college" and requires that scheduling be done to meet the needs of students, not on historical patterns. Instructional department chairs and deans prepare schedules of classes that consider student need

and demand for all courses that are required to meet certificate and degree requirements. They also examine fill rates and enrollment patterns to determine course offerings and degree completion needs to benefit students. The College has developed two tools to assist students in obtaining degrees or certificates in a timely fashion, a Course Distribution Chart and The Program Pathway Chart. The district passed Administrative Procedure 5055 to give a one-time priority registration to students with less than 16 units needed to graduate. (II.A.6)

Imperial Valley College uses delivery modes, teaching methodologies, and learning support services that reflect the diverse and changing needs of its students, in support of equity in success for all students. The Team affirmed that IVC has a variety of learning support services to address student needs regardless of modality. (II.A.7)

The team confirmed that Imperial Valley College does not utilize any department-wide course or program examinations. (II.A.8)

The Team confirmed that Imperial Valley College has policies (BP 4020) to award course credit, degrees, and certificates based on student attainment of learning outcomes. The Team found that not all syllabi reflect SLOs that are listed in the Course Outlines of Record. For course credit and awards to be based on Student Learning Outcomes, the SLOs across courses must be consistent. Furthermore, the spreadsheets on the Canvas SLO website from 2016 through 2018 show that many courses do not appear to be assessed recently. If courses have not been assessed for student achievement of Student Learning Outcomes, it is difficult to document that course credit, degree, and certificate awards are based on student attainment of learning outcomes. The institution has a tool and process for ensuring systematic evaluation of Student Learning Outcomes; however, at this time, the evaluation team found that the College does not consistently assess instructional programs and courses. Units of credit awarded are consistent with institutional policies that reflect generally accepted norms or equivalencies in higher education and the institution follows Federal standards for clock-to-credit-hour conversions. (II.A.9)

A review of the Imperial Valley College Catalog illustrates that the institution has stated transfer-of-credit policies in accepting transfer credits to fulfill degree requirements and that the institution certifies that the expected learning outcomes for transferred courses are comparable to the learning outcomes of its own courses. The Admissions and Records Office is planning to revise the College Catalog to include procedures for transfer of credits into Imperial Valley College in an appropriate Administrative Procedures document. A review of articulation agreements – such as one with Loma Linda University – illustrate that Articulation agreements are in place to assist with the transfer of students between institutions. (II.A.10)

The Team verified that the College Catalog has published communication competency, information competency, quantitative competency, analytic inquiry skills, ethical reasoning, the

ability to engage diverse perspectives, and other program-specific learning outcomes as evidenced by the ILO's (Communication Skills, Critical Thinking, Personal Responsibility, Information Literacy, and Global Awareness). Faculty map Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs) to Program Level Outcomes, and these ILOs are linked to course level student outcomes as illustrated in Course Outlines of Record, which are reviewed by the Curriculum Committee, and course syllabi developed by faculty. Similarly, the Distance Education Coordinator has developed a newly adopted Program Assessment Form that has faculty align program - and course-level Student Learning Outcomes with Institutional Level Student Learning Outcomes. (II.A.11)

The Team verified through IVC's Curriculum Review Process, that the College has identified a set of general education degree requirements for its associate degrees that ensures breadth of knowledge and promotes intellectual inquiry. The Student Learning Outcomes include a student's preparation for and acceptance of responsible participation in civil society, skills for lifelong learning and application of learning, and a broad comprehension of the development of knowledge, practice, and interpretive approaches in the arts and humanities, the sciences, mathematics, and social sciences. These general education degree requirements are developed in accordance with Board Policy and Administrative Policy 4025 - Philosophy and Criteria for Associate Degree and General Education – which establish the policies and procedures for general education degree requirements for its associate degrees. This process ensures breadth of knowledge and promotes intellectual inquiry. General education requirements are published in the College Catalog. The Curriculum Committee received training in 2018 to assure Curriculum development and approval processes adhered to appropriate guidelines. (II.A.12)

The Team reviewed Board Policies (4020, 4025) and Administrative Procedures (4020 & 4025) that establish the policies and procedures to assure that degree programs include focused study in at least one area of inquiry or an established interdisciplinary core. The Curriculum Review and Approval processes assure that degree programs include focused study or an interdisciplinary core. The Curriculum Committee also identifies specialized courses in an area of inquiry or interdisciplinary core that is based upon student learning outcomes and competencies and include mastery of key theories and practice. (II.A.13)

The Team found that Imperial Valley College graduates completing career-technical certificates and degrees demonstrate technical and professional competencies that meet employment standards or other applicable standards and preparation for external licensure and certification. The College Catalog indicates that the Career and Technical Education curriculum meets the degree and certificate requirements as defined in the Program and Course Approval Handbook. The 2018 Annual Report to ACCJC includes job placement rates. These results show that the rates were greater than the Institution Set Standard of 75% in eighteen out of twenty Career Education programs at IVC. Three programs at IVC, Vocational Nursing (VN), Registered

Nursing (RN) and Emergency Medical Services (EMT), have external licensure requirements. The job placement rates for these programs as listed in the Annual Report were 69% (VN), 92% (RN) and 85% (EMT) in the last reported year, 2016. These results indicate that graduates of Career and Technical Education programs at IVC are meeting technical and professional competencies. In addition, Career and Technical Education courses conduct regular advisory committee meetings and uses these to inform program decisions. The Institution Set Standards on licensing tests are reviewed annually and used for program improvement. (II.A.14)

The team validated that the institution follows an adopted program discontinuance procedure most recently approved in March 2017. AP 4021, outlines the College's Program Discontinuance policy, criteria for a program to be discontinued and describes the steps to enable students currently enrolled in the program to complete the program in a timely manner. The College ensures that appropriate course substitutions are available to facilitate student completion. (II.A.15)

The Team observed that Imperial Valley College has a robust Curriculum Committee that regularly evaluates and updates the curriculum for all credit and noncredit courses and programs based on a systematic schedule. The Community Education Not-for-Credit program periodically reviews their offerings based on student survey results. The Distance Education Committee identifies best practices for regular and effective contact and provide professional training opportunities for instructors teaching online. (II.A.16)

**Conclusion:** College meets the standard except for II.A.3.

#### **Recommendation for Compliance:**

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college engage in a robust learning outcomes assessment process that is consistent and comprehensive to improve all programs and services. (I.B.2, II.A.3, II.B.3, II.C.1, II.C.2)

## **II.B:** Library And Learning Support Services

#### **General Observations**

IVC has a wide variety of library and learning support services that contribute to student success at the institution. These services are provided primarily through the Spencer Library Media Center, the Study Skills Center and the recently combined Reading/Writing/Language Lab and Math Lab. All of these areas are open when classes are in session and are heavily used by students. Faculty and staff assigned to these areas are clearly passionate about helping students succeed. Recent investments such as the modernization and combination of the labs, the new

technology in the Study Skills Center, and the commitment to expand the classroom in the library equally demonstrate IVC's commitment to maintaining and improving these critical student support and learning service areas.

## Findings and Evidence

The Team confirmed that library and learning support services include a library that's open 57 hours per week with a faculty librarian available at all times, substantial collections of library materials, and a modern, cloud-based online catalog to aid research and discovery. Information literacy instruction is conducted in a classroom within the library. While the existing space is too small to accommodate more than 20 students at a time, an upgrade and expansion was recently approved based on an enhanced resource request. With regards to tutoring, students can make appointments or drop-in for tutoring services at the Skills Center. Demand for tutoring currently exceeds the number of tutors available as approximately 150 requests for appointments recently went unfulfilled. IVC's Embedded Tutor program has also grown dramatically in recent years and is popular with students and instructors alike as demonstrated by increased demand and satisfaction surveys. The Team encourages IVC to follow-through on its plan to expand the library classroom and to address the currently unmet demand for scheduled tutoring appointments. (II.B.1)

The Team verified that IVC relies on librarians and learning services staff to select and maintain library materials and educational equipment. Collection development is overseen by faculty librarians and guided by a Collection Development policy that was adopted in 2004. Collection development is also informed by reference questions posed by students. The resulting collections appear to be of sufficient size and scope to support the curriculum of the college; however, enhanced resource requests reviewed by the team document a need for additional funding to refresh the library's book collection. In 2015-2C16, categorical funds were used to acquire new technology for tutoring services. Technology needs going forward are expected to be submitted as enhanced resource requests through the Program Review process. (II.B.2)

The Team reviewed evidence that the library and learning support areas participate in the College's program review process and recent enhanced resource requests have resulted in funds being allocated to address identified needs. The library, Study Skills Center and the Reading/Writing/Language Lab conduct outcomes assessment using a variety of methods, including surveys and pre and post testing, to inform how well each area is doing. However, while data is collected and reviewed, outcomes assessment is not analyzed in a systematic way to consistently connect to the College's resource allocation process. Although IVC has a comprehensive program review process, the team found challenges in determining the integration of assessment results for improving the quality of all library services. The team suggests that the College continue to strengthen the library and learning services outcomes

assessment process integration with program review to ensure ongoing use of data to make improvements in programs and services and appropriate resource allocations. (II.B.3)

The Team found that when the IVC library and learning support services rely on outside entities for services - such as subscription databases, the library's online catalog, NetTutor online tutoring services, etc. - then formal agreements are maintained by the institution. Security gates and regular item inventories ensure that library materials are reasonably secured and accounted for. (II.B.4)

**Conclusion:** The College meets the standard except for II.B.3.

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college engage in a robust learning outcomes assessment process that is consistent and comprehensive to improve all programs and services. (I.B.2, II.A.3, II.B.3, II.C.1, II.C.2)

## **II.C Student Support Services**

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College provides comprehensive student support services and regularly evaluates the quality of the student learning and support to assure consistent and reliable delivery of those support services regardless of location or delivery method; services are delivered on campus, online, and offsite at two prisons, one county jail and four high schools. Program Review processes are in place to assess services annually with the intent to target improvement to those students in most need of support to achieve their educational goals. Additionally assessments are analyzed and the results are used to continuously improve student support services; however, the results are not consistently documented into program review across the division.

## **Findings and Evidence:**

IVC has established processes for regularly evaluating the quality of support services and the area outcomes so that student support services advance student learning, the College mission, and are effective regardless of location or means of delivery. Each area regularly examines its programs through the program review process, which is part of the Planning Cycle. Even though Student Services Areas are completing program review and SAO assessment is incorporated into the program review process, the integration is not systematic or consistent across all student service areas. (II.C.1)

The team confirmed that the College identifies and assesses learning support outcomes through the annual program review process by analyzing data trends, survey results, and other data/research to deliver support services that achieve those outcomes. The evaluation team found that IVC is highly responsive to the needs of its student population and community and that there is a strong connection between learning support outcomes for its student population and appropriate student support services and programs provided to achieve those outcomes, as evidenced through programs like the IVC Kitchen. Although IVC has a comprehensive program review process, the team found challenges in determining the integration of assessment results for improving the quality of all support services. The team suggests that the College continue to strengthen the student services outcomes assessment processes and ensure ongoing broad participation among constituent groups in the use of data to make improvements in programs and services. (II.C.2)

Through on-site visits, interviews, and review of the ISER, the team verified that the College provides access to appropriate comprehensive services for all students regardless of location or delivery method. Services include comprehensive counseling on campus and at off-site locations. Plans are in place to also provide campus-wide online counseling beginning fall 2019. The Team recognizes and commends the College for the commitment and work being performed by the Student Equity to respond to student needs and decrease food insecurity through the IVC Kitchen and the developing garden, as well as the work being done in the Student Health Center, specifically in addressing the needs of student mental health. In particular, the Team would like to recognize the College for its Inside Out program that works directly with both incarcerated students and IVC students and offers courses and student support services at the Imperial Valley Sheriff's Office. Services that are offered for Inside Out students include a full time counselor, financial aid advisor, tutoring and group advising and have resulted in positive outcomes related to recidivism and success. (II.C.3)

The Team confirmed that IVC offers a wide-range of co-curricular programs and athletics that adhere to sound educational practices and are suited to the institution to enhance the social and cultural experiences of its students. IVC provides its students with a variety of clubs and athletic programs that are not only discipline-related (e.g. Sociology, Nursing) but based on student interest and causes (e.g., Chicanx Club, Military and Veterans Support Club). A total of eleven sports teams with varied distribution across gender (5-men/6 women) provide student athletes with an opportunity to compete in baseball, basketball, cross country, soccer, softball, tennis and volleyball. Intercollegiate Athletic finances are controlled by the district and evaluated through the Program Review and budget allocation processes. (II.C.4)

The Imperial Valley College Counseling Department has a mission statement that includes assisting students in identifying and achieving educational, career, and personal development. There are over 40 full-time and part-time counselors that serve students in general Counseling,

CalWORKs, Student Support Services (SSS), Disabled Students Program & Services, Extended Opportunities Programs & Services (EOPS), Student Success and Support Programs (SSSP), Military and Veterans Services, Student Equity, and TRIO programs. Students are able to make appointments by phone and in person. The counseling department is currently conducting online counseling services via Cranium Café. All Counseling Services participate in professional development training led by their Counseling Training Taskforce. Additionally, all counselors meet consistently and work on improving advising services that ensure delivery of information about requirements and policies. (II.C.5)

The evaluation team reviewed the Board Policies and Administrative Procedures that guide IVC's admissions policies. These policies and procedures are consistent with IVC's mission. The College's Admissions and Records website shows that the College adheres with their admissions policy. In addition, IVC uses DegreeWorks to advise students and provide clear pathways to complete degrees, certificate and transfer goals. (II.C.6)

The Team observed that the College primarily utilizes Accuplacer to place students in Math and English. Accuplacer validation is regularly conducted by an external service. Students can also petition to be assessed via Multiple Measures, such as grades earned in high school. Students may appeal their initial placement. (II.C.7)

The Team confirmed that IVC has current Board Policies and Administrative Procedures (BP & AP 5040) in place to protect student confidentiality and to establish record retention and destruction processes. (II.C.8)

**Conclusion:** The College meets the standard except for II.C.1 and II.C.2.

#### **Recommendation:**

In order to meet the standards the team recommends the college engage in a robust learning outcomes assessment process that is consistent and comprehensive to improve all programs and services. (I.B.2, II.A.3, II.B.3, II.C.1, II.C.2)

# Standard III Resources

**Standard IIIA: Human Resources** 

#### **General Observations**

The College effectively uses its human resources to achieve its mission and to improve academic quality and institutional effectiveness. It demonstrates that personnel policies and procedures are clearly articulated and well documented. It has established policies and procedures for fair and equitable practices in hiring and maintaining its staff. Earnest attempts have occurred to diversify its faculty and staff. Faculty job descriptions and evaluations include substantive attention to assessment of SLOs. College practices for hiring faculty and staff are clearly articulated in procedure manuals. The College employs sufficient numbers of administrators, faculty and staff to support the mission and effective educational, technological, physical, and administrative operations of the institution, and ensures that they are qualified by appropriate education, training, and experience. All personnel are evaluated and faculty and academic administrator's evaluations include a component of assessment of student learning outcomes to improve teaching and learning. The College upholds a written code of professional ethics for all of its personnel, including consequences for violation. The College plans for and provides all personnel with opportunities for continued professional development, consistent with the institutional mission and based on evolving pedagogy, technology, and learning needs. The institution makes provision for the security and confidentiality of personnel records. Each employee has access to his/her personnel records in accordance with law. All human resource functions are compliant with regards to distance education (DE).

## **Findings and Evidence**

Human Resources (March 2018) and Administrative Services (August 2018) went through reorganization which created new classifications with qualifications which better meet the mission and goals of the college. Imperial Valley College has established policies and procedures for recruitment and selection of faculty, staff, and administrators that meet the requirements of their positions. Hiring criteria for faculty are determined by state and local policies. The College utilizes the current Minimum Qualifications for Faculty and Administrators in California Community Colleges Handbook in determining faculty and administrator qualifications for a particular discipline or administrator position. The Academic Senate Equivalency Committee reviews all applications for equivalency in faculty applications. All job descriptions and announcements are publicly posted on the website for public and employee access. New classifications are established as a result of the program review process, reclassification process, and reorganization. (III.A.1)

Imperial Valley College uses a consistent multi-step process (qualifications review, two levels of interviews, teaching demonstration/oral presentation) to assess faculty candidate's subject matter knowledge and skills relevant to each position. The screening process includes verification of the credentials and work experience of faculty candidates. Faculty job descriptions include clear statements of responsibilities that include development and review of curriculum, as well as assessment of student learning. (III.A.2)

Job descriptions for administrators and other positions supporting institutional effectiveness and academic quality include requisite education and experience requirements. Job descriptions are updated by HR to include evolving institutional responsibilities. HR personnel verify candidate qualifications prior to employment consideration. The College uses appropriate hiring standards for its educational managers and supervisors to reflect the preparation needed to sustain institutional effectiveness and academic quality. For example, educational administrators are required to have a minimum of a master's degree and one year of formal training, internship, or leadership experience related to position requirements. The College's hiring committees adopt appropriate questions and conduct interviews for staff and administrators. Activities in the interview include demonstrations, skills, or other simulated job duties relevant to the position to assess the applicant's qualifications and academic quality. The inclusion in the job description of learning outcomes assessment ensures institutional effectiveness and continuous improvement. (III.A.3)

The College has established policies and procedures regarding the evaluation of educational degrees earned by faculty, administrators, and support personnel. Applicants and employees seeking promotional opportunities are required to submit official transcripts from accredited institutions. Faculty serving as Academic Senate representatives on the screening committee also review the transcripts and degrees to ensure they are from an accredited institution. Degrees earned from non-U.S. institutions are returned to the applicant as incomplete until the applicant sends the transcripts/degrees through an approved institution for equivalency. (III.A.4)

IVC has established a system of performance evaluation for faculty, staff, and administrative personnel that are clearly articulated in the negotiated contracts for each constituent group as well as delineated in Board policies and administrative procedures. Per the contract, full time faculty are slated to be evaluated every year during the tenure process or if employed in a temporary status and every three years after receiving tenure. Part-time faculty are scheduled to be evaluated the first year of employment and every three years after. Confidential and classified employees are evaluated twice during the first probationary period and every other year after. Additional evaluations are performed as a result of a performance improvement plan when appropriate. Administrators are evaluated their first year of employment and every two years thereafter. The evaluation team was unable to

determine, through the evidence provided, that the college's evaluation process was systematic and occurring in intervals dictated by Board policy and administrative procedures. Based on the evaluation team's review, it appears that IVC does not adhere to the evaluation schedule. IVC recognized the significant turnover of key leadership positions and also provided information relative to the changes in evaluation oversight from the Office of Instruction to the Human Resources department as a way to mitigate the evaluation timeline challenges. (III.A.5)

Faculty and administrators assess student learning outcomes as a resource to improve teaching and learning. At the faculty convocation and other times throughout the academic year, faculty and administrators are provided training on assessing SLOs. Evaluation of Duties and Responsibilities forms in the Full-Time Faculty CBA are used for both full and part time faculty. These forms include "E. Participates in the development, assessment, and evaluation of student learning outcomes/services area outcomes as appropriate." (III.A.6)

Due to the remote location of the college it is more difficult to secure part time instructors. IVC has established part time faculty pools in 22 disciplines in order to be responsive to student needs and spikes in enrollment. Recruitment of part time faculty continues to be a challenge due to local demographics; however, IVC has been able to maintain adequate number of faculty to carry out the mission of the college and maintain quality of instruction. (III.A.7)

Opportunities for part-time faculty participation in the teaching and learning aspects of college operations and decision-making are provided and encouraged. IVC provides Adjunct Faculty with an orientation to discuss duties and responsibilities, college resources, classroom management, providing help for students, the professional development obligation, and ways to get involved in the life of the campus. Adjunct faculty are supervised directly by the division dean and indirectly by the department chairperson or director. (III.A.8)

The College has procedures in place to maintain adequate and properly qualified staff and administrators to support operations of the institution and its mission within the funding available. Staffing decisions are tied to program reviews and available resources. IVC ensures that staff and administrators who are hired possess the necessary qualifications to perform their duties. Job classifications and job descriptions are reviewed and updated to incorporate enhanced job duties, new technology, and redistributing work to make the classified ranks more effective and efficient in support of college operations, service to students, and mission. The College's current administrative structure includes the President, VP Administrative Services, VP Academic Services, VP Student Services, Chief Human Resources Officer, Chief Technology Officer, 4 academic deans, 2 associate deans, 2 student services deans, and several

directors/supervisors. The ratio (administrator to employee) is approximately 1:35. (III.A.9; III.A.10)

The College's personnel policies and procedures are clearly articulated and readily available on the College website. Policies are kept up-to-date and aligned with changing laws and regulations through an annual policy and procedure retreat and Board review. The College annually assesses the effectiveness of its policies and practices. Written personnel policies and procedures are maintained in Board Policies, Administrative Services, and Human Resources. Personnel policies are also delineated in the faculty and classified collective bargaining agreements, which are found on the Employee Unions website, as well as the Classified Management and Confidential Employee Handbook. (III.A.11)

The College supports the needs of its diverse personnel. In spring 2018, the College updated and implemented a three-year EEO and Diversity Plan, which includes an annual review of demographics and strategies in recruiting a diverse work force. The EEO plan calls for diversity training for all screening committee members prior to the screening and hiring process. (III.A.12)

The College adheres to a clearly defined code of professional ethics outlined in BP 2715 Code of Ethics and the Institutional Code of Ethics is posted on the college website. Trainings are provided by an outside legal firm and employees are invited to attend related subject matters. (III.A.13)

The College recently implemented a three-year Professional Development Plan that outlines the roles and responsibilities of the Professional Development Committee, Human Resources, departments, and employees. One of the goals is to provide opportunities for professional growth across all employee groups. Additionally, professional development has gained a greater priority and focus to include a Title V grant for the development of a Teaching & Learning Center and for faculty professional development. Although a Professional Development Plan is in place the College did not adequately demonstrate that it maintains consistent plans for evaluating the efficacy of the professional development efforts. The team found minimal and inconsistent evidence to demonstrate that the institution systematically evaluates professional development programs and uses the results of these evaluations as the basis for improvement. Additionally, the team found little evidence to support that it uses professional development data from needs assessment surveys, program reviews, and institutional performance indicators to identify needed areas of focus for each group to meaningfully impact student achievement and learning. (III.A.14)

The District provides for the security and confidentiality of its personnel records through physical precautions that secure the locations in which files are stored and through training

of employees regarding the Public Records Act and related privacy acts. All employees have access to their personnel records upon written request. (III.A.15)

#### **Conclusion:**

The College meets the standard.

# **College Recommendation for Improvement:**

## Recommendation 3:

In order to improve institutional effectiveness the team recommends the college follow its performance evaluation cycle and process for all employees. (III.A.5)

# Recommendation 4:

In order to improve institutional effectiveness the team recommends the college improve the evaluation and assessment of the professional development efforts. (III.A.14)

## **Standard IIIB: Physical Resources**

#### **General Observations**

Imperial Valley College is the only community college serving residents of the Imperial County. The college consists of one campus centrally located in an unincorporated area of the county. The college has a total of 44 buildings with an outside gross square footage of 321,837.

## Findings and Evidence

Physical resources are integrated with institutional planning through a visioning process that includes community input and the development of a Five-Year Construction Plan which is included in the Five-Year Capital Outlay Plan. IVC continues to improve the integration of the program review process with the Facility Master Plan and the Strategic Educational Master Plan. All facilities have a master plan for scheduled maintenance to ensure that facilities are well maintained and provide the necessary quality for the students and staff. There is a Five-Year Scheduled Maintenance Plan which includes safety, security, access, and infrastructure upgrades to the campus. This maintenance plan is updated annually. (III.B.1)

The College has a Five-Year Capital Outlay Plan (2017-2021), which includes the Inventory of Land, the Five-Year Construction Plan, Capacity Load Ratios, and Space Inventory. The plan is

reviewed on an annual basis and updated as needed. This plan is derived through the Visioning Process, the program review process, and input from the campus community. A major component of this process is performing a capacity load ratio analysis as part of the space utilization review. The college's planning process includes input from faculty, staff, students, community members, and administrators as a part of the ongoing integrated planning cycle. The effectiveness of facilities and equipment are evaluated on a regular basis through the Facilities, Environmental Health and Safety Committee, Executive Council, and various subcommittees. (III.B.2)

All facilities have a master plan for scheduled maintenance to ensure that facilities are well maintained and provide the necessary quality for the students and staff. The Maintenance and Operations Director, with the assistance of the Administrative Assistant for Business Services, has developed a schedule of deferred maintenance to be implemented when budgeted resources become available. These schedules include safety, security, access, and infrastructure upgrades to the campus. (III.B.3)

College staff, the district architect, and facilities consultants annually compile the effective use of physical resources through the space inventory. Outcomes of space inventory evaluation, the district strategic plan, the college Strategic Educational Master Plan, the Scheduled Maintenance Projects for Funding report, and other data serve as frameworks for the development of the Five-Year Construction. The college relies on evaluation for improvement of facilities to meet the needs of students. The Facilities, Environmental Health and Safety Committee reviews data. Recommendations are based on input from the district architect, the Director of Maintenance and Operations, and College Council. Equipment purchases are reviewed by the Facilities, Environmental Health & Safety Committee and are prioritized so that the most crucial needs are addressed first. All recommendations are forwarded to the President's Cabinet for final decision. (III.B.4)

#### **Conclusion**

The College meets the standard.

## **IIIC. Technology Resources**

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College provides technology resources that promote student success in their educational and career goals and for access to instruction and student support services. The College ensures that its various types of technology needs are identified and then evaluated via

the input from all constituency groups via the Technology Planning Committee. The 2017-2022 Technology Plan sets the foundation and goals for technology on campus. The technology support index is evaluated each year and provides a status on where the campus is on each of the many campus wide goals which in turn drives the Information Technology Activities list which is approved on a yearly basis by the Technology Planning Committee. Technology services, support, hardware, and software are currently adequate to support the institution's programs and services. The faculty, staff and managers supporting information technology at the College are passionate and creative in finding solutions that improve the services for the students and their colleagues.

#### **Findings and Evidence:**

Imperial Valley College has developed structures through program review and institutional technology planning to ensure that technology needs of the campus are identified and addressed on an ongoing basis. The Information Technology department oversees a variety services that impact both information and academic computing technologies. The department provides technical support, hardware and software support, infrastructure management and maintenance, communications network management, and support of instructional platforms. Although the Information Technology assesses achievement of previous goals and objectives established through program review and the Technology Plan, interviews indicated that evaluation of the effectiveness of technology in meeting the needs of the institution is inconsistent. The evaluation team determined that technology is integrated with the regular planning and program review processes of the College and is sufficient to maintain and sustain teaching and learning in all modalities.

The Distance Education (DE) Committee oversees the improvement of the technology and pedagogical knowledge among faculty involved in online or hybrid courses. The DE Committee works with faculty, staff, and students to determine instruction technology needs and evaluate tools. Such was the case in 2016 when the DE Committee recommended the move from Blackboard to Canvas and was subsequently affirmed by the Academic Senate and the governing board (III.C.1)

The College maintains a Technology Plan that provides guidance and directs the updates, replacements, and standards for computer equipment as well as infrastructure. The plan was developed through the integrated planning process, specifically through the Technology Planning Committee, as well as through the gathering of data from program reviews. The Technology Plan supported the creation of an Enterprise department to transition from a repair/replace to a refresh/warranty model services. The College has developed strategies to support computer refreshes funded on a five-year cycle. Although enterprise equipment is not currently on the same five-year funding cycle and is being replaced on an as-funds-are-available-basis, the College has put into place a Multi-Year Projection matrix to show yearly costs to refresh each of

the areas. The College's efforts in this area could be improved through the development of a more comprehensive total cost of ownership model for all college technology. The evaluation team was unable to find evidence that Information Technology assesses through student or employee surveys to ensure that the technological infrastructure is adequate to support the College's operations, programs, and services. Interviews indicated this evaluation is done through an extremely informal way via dialog with key personnel and committee work. (III.C.2)

Imperial Valley College ensures that technology resources and services are available and standards for technology and infrastructure have been established. Documentation to ensure reliability, disaster recovery, privacy and security of its technology systems and data is found within the Technology Plan. (III.C.3)

Imperial Valley College makes every effort to provide appropriate technology training and support for faculty, staff, students, and administrators. The Information Technology Department maintains an online help desk system and also has a support number. If faculty, staff, or administrators need support or assistance with the classroom technology, access to email, Banner, or any of the other technology on campus, they can place a call to the support desk or enter a ticket into the online helpdesk system.

The Library and Media Center provides training and support to faculty, staff, and students on appropriate use of library resources. The technician is available to support the students in the following areas: Canvas, WebSTAR, PaperCut, login credentials, email accounts, admission applications, DegreeWorks, and other library functions.

The College contracts with Ninjio to provide security awareness training to staff, faculty, and administrators. Ninjio is a cloud-based company that creates informative three to five minute security training productions every month based on current security events. All staff, faculty, and administrators are assigned an account which allows them to access the videos.

Imperial Valley College recently was awarded a Title V grant which afforded them the ability to expand professional development and strengthen and expand support services to changing student needs. The TALCAS grant provides training to faculty as they transition to Canvas, exposes faculty to new ideas about technology, and provides more specialized training in advanced Canvas technique and strategies, and supports travel to conferences and workshops specific to technology. The College's new Teaching and Learning Center (TLC) is a state-of-the-art facility specifically designed to engage faculty in new technologies and teaching strategies within the classroom setting. (III.C.4)

The institution relies upon a variety of sources of policy and procedure to govern the use of technology in the teaching and learning processes. Sources of policy related to the use of

technology include Board Policy 3720 as well as policies related to passwords, back-ups, disaster recovery, remote access, and equipment orders found in the IT Policies and Procedures Manual. The DE Committee has established guidelines for training and professional development of faculty teaching online/hybrid courses in DE Faculty Handbook. (III.C.5)

#### **Conclusion:**

The College meets the Standard.

#### Standard IIID: Fiscal Responsibility and Stability

#### **General Observations**

The College has sufficient financial resources to sustain the educational and operational programs of the institution. Over the last three years, the College has maintained a status quo budgeting process and has decreased expenditures for salaries and benefits. The College has financial resources sufficient to support student learning programs and services and to improve institutional effectiveness. The resource allocation model supports the development, maintenance, and enhancement of programs and services. Internally prepared budgets and financial statements, annual external audited financial statements, annual external audit findings and other related documents reflect the College's commitment to maintaining financial integrity. The College is meeting all of the necessary budgeting and accounting standards and practices with no significant exceptions.

# **Findings and Evidence**

#### **Planning**

The College has demonstrated sufficient financial resources to support and sustain student learning programs and services and improve institutional effectiveness. As illustrated in the last three audit reports, the College is meeting all of the necessary budgeting and accounting standards and practices with no significant exceptions. The 2018-2019 Adopted budget shows salaries and benefits accounting for approximately 82% of the overall unrestricted general fund budget. The new Student Centered Funding Formula will increase the revenue by 18.23% for fiscal year 2018-19 over the previous year.

The Strategic Educational Master Plan Committee (SEMPC) annually reviews the mission and goals of the College in the development and update of the Strategic Educational Master Plan. The Budget and Fiscal Planning Committee develops the Budget Principles, Guidelines, and

Priorities. The evaluation team found evidence to support that IVC establishes goals for budget priorities and links it to the strategic plan goals, as well as the program review processes. Decisions for funding requests are derived from data analysis and tied to institutional priorities. The processes are well documented, include all funding sources, and are available through the College's online portal for all stakeholders to review. (III.D.1)

Budget information is disseminated to the institution in the form of tentative and final budget documents. Financial information is available to the campus community by means of the annual and quarterly budget reports. In addition, the external audit reports are available on the College's Audit website. (III.D.2)

The budget planning process is established with the participation of all constituents through Program Review. The budget preparation process is based upon analysis and evaluation of data as it relates to fulfilling the mission of the College. Instructional programs make budget recommendations primarily through the program review process. The process helps ensure that the budget allocates resources to the needs of the institution. The Budget and Fiscal Planning Committee provides budget oversight. (III.D.3)

#### Fiscal Responsibility and Stability

The College has demonstrated that it uses available resources in a fiscally prudent manner and retains adequate reserves for unforeseen needs, as well to address scheduled increases in the College's required contributions to the California State Teacher's Retirement System (STRS) and California Public Employee's Retirement System (PERS) and its Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEB) liabilities. The evaluation team confirmed that the College has multiple protocols for internal controls, including dividing authority between various departments and with the Imperial County of Education, which processes all warrants. The consistent lack of audit findings shows that these processes follow appropriate protocols and are deemed successful. (III.D.4, III.D.5, III.D.7, III.D.8).

The College and the governing board are committed to maintaining a minimum reserve of 6% to help lessen the impact of unforeseen financial requirements. In June 2013, the governing board also approved to exceed the minimum reserve with a recommended level of 16.6% as this represents approximately two months of operating costs. This action followed the development of a Fund Balance Policy by the Budget and Fiscal Planning Committee in March 2013. The function of this reserve is to provide a safeguard for the financial stability of the College, and it is maintained by careful planning and oversight by the Budget and Fiscal Planning Committee and the President's Cabinet. (III.D.4).

The institution has developed board policies and administrative procedures guiding appropriate processes and control mechanisms. These include: BP/AP 6200, BP/AP 6250, BP/AP 6300, BP/AP

6301, AP 6305, and BP/AP 6400. As evidenced by CCFS 311 reports and audits, the College has followed appropriate processes and control mechanisms to provide support to the student learning programs and services. The College continues to disseminate information regarding the budget as evidenced by the online accessibility of the budget, quarterly reports, and monthly budget reports. (III.D.5)

IVC maintains proper budget documentation and independent audits reflecting appropriate and relevant allocation of financial resources to support student learning programs and services as set out in the Program Review Handbook. The information is sufficient and provided in a timely fashion. The College is in compliance with all budget and accounting practices as outlined in the California Community College Budget and Accounting Manual (BAM) and the Government Accounting Standards Board (GASB), along with applicable provisions of the California Education Code. (III.D.6)

There were no financial statement findings or questioned costs noted during the fiscal years under review: 30 June 2013, 30 June 2014, 30 June 2015, 30 June 2016, 30 June 2017, 30 June 2018. (III.D.7)

An independent Certified Public Accounting firm reviews and evaluates the College's major internal control systems for effectiveness in preventing material errors from occurring in the financial operations of the institution. (III.D.8)

#### Liabilities

The evaluation team found that the College has set aside funds for almost every conceivable liability, including OPEB, upcoming PERS/STRS increases, technology, and further capital expansion. The governing board regularly approved Adopted Budget which reflects a balanced budget. As a result of the additional revenue from the Student Success Funding Formula, the district's unrestricted general fund budget for salaries and benefits for the 2018-2019 fiscal year are at approximately 86%. To further manage risk, the College remains conservative with all of its investment of idle cash. The College invests its funds in a Local Agency Investment Fund (LAIF) operated by Imperial County. This fund is extremely low risk and allows the College to maintain liquidity in the event that funds are needed to address emergency measures. (III.D.9)

The College's audits provide evidence of effective oversight of finances. Independent External Audits include an analysis of financial aid, grants, externally funded programs, contractual relationships, auxiliary organizations, and foundations. The College uses Imperial County Office of Education services for payroll and as the fiscal agent that provides additional checks and balances. The College maintains all funds with the Imperial County Treasurer and all investments are part of the county pool with the exception of the District's irrevocable trust which is maintained with Vanguard.

The College's grant funds are tracked separately, and the College maintains strategic controls over fund prioritization and allocations. Annual external audits confirm appropriate management of Foundation funds, as well as compliance with the College's major federal funding program requirements, including Title IV. Annual internal and external audits confirm that the College is in compliance with all federal requirements in the packaging and disbursing of federal financial aid. An USDE program review confirmed College's financial aid policies and procedures regarding institutional and student eligibility, individual student financial aid and academic files, attendance records, student account ledgers, and default rate management. (III.D.10)

The College's Vice President for Administrative Services or designee is in charge of maintaining and monitoring the district's finances, financial aid, grants, externally funded programs, contractual relationships, auxiliary organizations, and assets. All investments are handled by the Imperial County Treasurer as part of the county-wide pool. External, independent audits confirm that the institution practices effective oversight of all financial resources. (III.D.11)

At its September 2018 meeting, the governing board adopted a resolution to create Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEB) Trust. The Trust was designed to be an irrevocable trust which would manage the funds set aside to address the institution's liabilities for pension obligations. From fiscal year 2013-14 through fiscal year 2016-17, a total of \$620,000 had been dedicated and contributed to the irrevocable trust established in 2018-19. (III.D.12)

IVC completes annual assessments and allocation of resources for the repayment of any locally incurred debt instruments. At the writing of this self-evaluation report, no locally incurred debt instruments carry a balance. The College paid off a Lease Revenue Bond in August 2017. (III.D.13)

The district's auxiliary activities include the Cafeteria, Bookstore, Associated Student Government and Student Clubs. All financial resources from these activities and from fundraising efforts and grants are used with integrity and in a manner, consistent with the College mission and goals. The IVC Foundation is a separate 501(c)3 non-profit organization that exists to support Imperial Valley College and its students. Each of these auxiliary organizations are included in the district annual independent audit. (III.D.14)

The College does not participate in student loans. (III.D.15)

#### Contractual Agreements

The College contracts with a variety of external entities for a wide scope of services. All contracts and agreements are reviewed for scope of service and binding legal requirements such as dates, terms, and other conditions. All contracts and agreements are reviewed by the area Vice

President and Superintendent/President and then forwarded to the governing board. Legal counsel reviews the contracts as requested. (III.D.16)

# Conclusion

The College meets the Standard.

# Standard IV Leadership and Governance

# **IVA. Decision-Making Roles and Processes**

#### **General Observations:**

Imperial Valley College demonstrates a commitment to participatory governance through collegial collaboration by all constituent groups. Board Policies adopted by the Board of Trustees and internal documentation on the College's Participatory Governance Structure identify participatory governance committees, specify broad membership on those committees, and detail the organizational hierarchies for each committee. All members of the campus community have ample opportunity for access to and engagement in decision-making processes, both as part of formal structures and through a variety of informal avenues. Multiple lines of communication function in both directions: there are sufficient opportunities for all members of the campus community to submit items for consideration, and there are many avenues for decision-making bodies to engage with and report out to the broader community.

## **Findings and Evidence**

The evaluation team conducted numerous interviews with institutional leadership from President's Cabinet, Associated Student Government, Academic Senate, and College Council and found evidence to support that Imperial Valley College leadership promotes a culture of innovation and institutional improvement. Interviews confirmed that Imperial Valley College encourages creativity as a means to improve student outcomes and achievement, learning and student support. Administration, faculty, staff, and students confirmed an organizational culture that welcomes new ideas and interventions. Some of those discussed during the interviews include a project for priority registration for last term priority, IVC Kitchen, the new Housing Project, Bus transportation to Calexico, and the Teaching and Learning for Achievement and Success (TALCAS) improvements. Imperial Valley College's participatory governance structure and process is posted on the College website and provides ample opportunities for all campus members to bring ideas forward and participate in institutional decision-making processes. (IV.A.1)

Board Policy 2510 as well as documentation on the College's website pertaining to standing rules of each participatory governance committee provides an adequate outline of the overarching institutional governance structure adopted by the College Council and Board of Trustees. The *Participatory Governance Structure* defines the roles of faculty, students, classified staff, and management in the development of College policies, planning and budget related to each constituent group's area of responsibility and expertise. Each of the participatory

governance committees (College Council, Professional Development Committee, Competitive Athletics, Facilities and Environmental Health and Safety, Public Relations and Marketing, Student Affairs, Enrollment Management, CART, Strategic Enrollment Management Planning, EEO and Diversity, Student Learning Outcomes/Service Area Outcomes, Technology Planning Committee, Guided Pathways Steering Committee) has a clearly delineated standing rules for meetings, agendas, purpose, functions, procedures, and membership structures. Evidence suggests that all segments of the campus community (administration, faculty, classified staff, and students) are represented on each committee, with students particularly engaged on College Council, SEMP, CART, Technology Planning, and Distance Education. Each committee evaluates its goals and objectives annually in a standardized reporting template posted on the College website. (IV.A.2)

Through Board Policy 2510, faculty and administrators have a key role in the institutional governance processes with defined roles in planning and budget. Agendas and minutes from the participatory governance committees, specific to these areas, reflect that faculty and administrators are carrying out their roles as codified in Board Policy. Administrators and faculty serve as representatives on the Strategic Educational Master Plan Committee and the Budget & Fiscal Planning Committee. (IV.A.3)

Board Policy 4020 defines the College's responsibility for developing course and program curriculum appropriate to the mission. The institution relies primarily upon Academic Senate subcommittees and structures, including the Curriculum Committee, for recommendations regarding student learning programs and curriculum. The Participatory Governance Structure clearly outlines the specific committee structures as well as organizational hierarchies. The governance process is integrated with the program review and resource allocation process. (IV.A.4)

The evaluation team confirmed College leadership follows its governance and decision-making processes and strives to take relevant and diverse points of view into appropriate consideration early in key decision-making processes. Interviews with Academic Senate, College Council leadership, and Associated Student Government representatives confirmed that the participatory governance decision-making is inclusive and allows for appropriate consideration of all constituent perspectives. The institution procedures and policies related to participatory governance clearly specify the roles of all constituent groups, including academic roles of faculty in areas focused on student educational programs and services. It was apparent through evidence and interviews that participatory leadership is informed of their respective roles and considered collaborative and valued partners in institutional decision-making. Faculty and staff are partners with the administration in creating an institution that is student centered and focused on the needs of the community it serves. (IV.A.5)

Policies, procedures, and other relevant documents are available on the College website. The evaluation team found that committee meeting minutes and agendas served as the primary documentation for disseminating decision-making and resulting decisions. Informally, the institution uses dialog through committee reports and updates to communicate decisions. The Superintendent/President also provides updates to employees via a monthly President's Update communicated electronically to the campus community following each Board meeting. (IV.A.6)

Interviews performed by the evaluation team found that the College's participatory governance committees regularly evaluate the function, charge, and overall effectiveness of meeting objectives and goals established in the context of the overall institutional goals on an annual basis. Participatory governance evaluation reports are presented to College Council and the Academic Senate, as appropriate. A standardized tool/template is used for the evaluation reports and is published on the College website. (IV.A.7).

#### **Conclusion:**

The College meets the Standards

#### **IVB.** Chief Executive Officer

## **General Observations**

Imperial Valley College has adequate policies and procedures assigning responsibility and authority over the institution to the CEO with delegation of duties to other responsible and qualified personnel. The evaluation team found that the institution demonstrates a culture of effective participatory governance and collaboration. Interviews indicated that this culture is highly attributable to the Superintendent/President's openness and willingness to engage and communicate with all constituents.

## Findings and Evidence

Board Policy 2430 delegates authority to the Superintendent/President for primary responsibility for the quality of the institution. The team found evidence of the Superintendent/President's leadership and coordination in planning, organizing, budgeting, selecting and developing personnel, and assessing institutional effectiveness. The CEO ensures planning efforts involves the entire campus community and local constituents. (IV.B.1)

The Superintendent/President plans, oversees, and evaluates an administrative structure organized and staffed to reflect the institution's purposes, size, and complexity. The President's

Cabinet includes the Vice President Administrative Services, Vice President Academic Services, Vice President Student Services, Chief Human Resources Officer, and the Chief Technology Officer. The Superintendent/President delegates authority to administrators and others consistent with their responsibilities per Board Policy 2430. Over the last year, the Superintendent/President, through the use of program review documentation, with input from the President's Cabinet, restructured two departments (Administrative Services and Human Resources) in order to strengthen the College's organizational and operational capacity to support the institution. In this manner, the Superintendent/President establishes the organizational charts that delineate the lines of responsibilities and general duties of the institution (Board Policy 3100). (IV.B.2).

The evaluation team concluded the Superintendent/President guides institutional improvement in teaching and learning through established policies and procedures as approved by the Board of Trustees. In numerous interviews conducted by the evaluation team, the Superintendent/President was found to encourage and promote a collegial environment that sets institutional performance standards for student achievement, goals, and priorities as outlined in the Strategic Educational Master Plan. Educational planning is integrated with resource planning and allocation to support student achievement and learning as demonstrated through the College's evidence located in SPOL.

Although the Superintendent/President ensures that the institution uses data, research, and program review to drive decision-making and resource allocation, wide-spread evaluation is not conducted consistently. Interviews with the campus community confirm that the CEO provides leadership in being responsive to the College's mission, values, standards, goals and priorities; a program review framework that links to planning and resource allocation; and a comprehensive participatory governance structure with defined and broad membership, charges, goal development, evaluation, and clear routes for decision-making and communication. (IV.B.3)

Board Policy 3200 assigns the primary responsibility and leadership for accreditation to the Superintendent/President. During the development of the ISER, Imperial Valley College experienced transition in leadership at the CEO level. Despite this turnover, the leadership for Accreditation remained intact and the evaluation team concluded that faculty, staff, administrative leaders, and students were actively involved in the ISER process, supported by the College's CART. Under the supervision of the Accreditation Liaison Officer, CART serves in an advisory capacity to the President's Cabinet and Academic Senate in regards to assuring compliance with accreditation eligibility, standards, and requirements. (IV.B.4)

The Superintendent/President assures the implementation of statutes, regulations, and governing Board Policies and that institutional practices are consistent with the institutional mission and policies, including effective control of budget and expenditures. The Superintendent/President

uses Board Policy to guide the development of procedures to support the mission of the College. Policies and procedures are stated to be regularly reviewed for currency and compliance with external statutes and regulations. Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 2410 defines Board Policies and Administrative Procedures. Evidence and interviews indicate that the College subscribes to biannual policy and procedure updates from the Community College League of California to guide policy review. Board policy dictates that Board Policies and Administrative Procedures are maintained through a systematic three-year review and evaluation; however, there appears to be some inconsistencies in the adherence to this policy. The Board Policy and Administrative Procedures documented on BoardDocs reflect a 2015 review/approval on most, if not all the policies and procedures. After further investigation, the College provided a separate spreadsheet outlining the administrative review timelines and approval. It appears the College has made a concerted effort to update and review most of the Board Policies and Administrative Procedures in December 2018. (IV.C.5)

The evaluation team found evidence to support that the Superintendent/President ensures that communities served by the College are regularly informed about the institution. The Superintendent/President is actively involved in a variety of statewide advisory committees and taskforces and community-based organizations. The evaluation team confirmed the Superintendent/President actively communicates with the College community through a regularly published President Update disseminated through the College's email and archived on the College's website. A monthly College update is also published in the Imperial Valley Press. Meeting minutes and agendas are readily available on the website and a variety of engagement opportunities, both formal and informal, for interacting with the Superintendent/President and the College leadership team for exchange of ideas and information. The president regularly and effectively engages with the external community to both promote College activities and solicit input and support. Perhaps the most powerful testament to the effectiveness of her community engagement and responsiveness to the community's needs is the development of the Inside/Out College Program. The program is the first in the state to successfully develop and provide college credit courses for adults incarcerated at a county and a state correctional facility through a partnership with a community college. This program seeks to improve public safety by reducing recidivism through education and reentry services in support of educational goal attainment and career development. (IV.B.6)

#### **Conclusion:**

The College meets the Standards

#### **IVC. Governing Board**

#### **General Observations**

Imperial Valley College has a seven-member board elected by the public, and a non-voting student elected by the general student body. The Board of Trustees roles and responsibilities related to the College are clearly stated and widely disseminated via institutional policies. All Board policies are publicly available online on the College website through BoardDocs.

Per Board policy and the College governance structure, the Academic Senate maintains primary responsibility for academic and professional matters, including curriculum, distance education, basic skills and learning outcomes and assessment. Information regarding College participatory governance processes, committees, communication is comprehensive and accessible on the College website.

Interviews revealed that the Imperial Valley College Board of Trustee members are actively engaged in the community and committed to the success, achievement, and well-being of their students. The Board of Trustee members are active advocates for promoting higher education opportunities as a means to positively impact and transform the local community.

# **Findings and Evidence**

Board policies (BP 2000, 2010, 2200, 2210) clearly delineate the Board's responsibility and authority in assuring the academic quality, integrity, and effectiveness, as well as financial stability of the College. Interviews with Board members and review of the agendas and minutes demonstrate the Board receives sufficient institutional information that provides them with the ability to exercise their authority in an informed and collegial manner. The Board receives monthly programmatic, budget, research, and other updates related to institutional progress in meeting specific student success metrics and goals. (IV.C.1).

The Board of Trustees acts collectively as an independent policy-making body. The decisions and policies of the Board of Trustees are acted upon by a majority of the vote. The evaluation team found evidence through Board minutes and interviews that although there can be dissension and discussion amongst Board members, regardless of the vote, decisions are collectively supported by the entire Board. (IV.C.2)

Board Policy 2431 outlines the responsibilities of the Board to establish and follow a process for selecting the President/Superintendent. Imperial Valley College recently recruited and selected a new President/Superintendent effective July 1, 2018. Based on interviews and review of the evidence, the evaluation team confirmed that the process established through the policy was followed. The Board acts in accordance with Board Policy 2435, which calls for the Board to

evaluate the President/Superintendent on an annual basis using an evaluation developed jointly that takes into consideration the president's job description, performance goals, and objectives. The evaluation team determined that the President/Superintendent's annual evaluation is currently in progress and is slated for completion by April 2019. Evidence collected by the evaluation team confirmed that CEO evaluations for the previous President/Superintendent were completed in accordance with the Board Policy. (IV.C.3)

Imperial Valley College Board Members are elected to represent seven separate regions and must reside in the area from which he/she is elected to ensure that all regions of the College's service area are duly represented. Although each Board member is a representative from distinct regions of the service area, the Board acts as an independent body that reflects the public interest in the institution's educational quality. The evaluation team determined the Board adheres to policies outlining conflicts of interest (Board Policy 2710), Code of Ethics (Board Policy 2715), and Political Activity (Board Policy 2716) to ensure that there are protocols protecting the institution from undue influence or political pressure. (IV.C.4)

In keeping with Board Policy 2410 the Board establishes policies consistent with the mission to ensure the quality, integrity, and improvement of student learning programs. The Board regularly receives reports and presentations that enable it to successfully exercise their responsibilities for assuring the educational quality and effectiveness, legal compliance, financial integrity, and stability of the College. The Board regularly reviews reports on student achievement data and metrics demonstrating College progress in meeting student success goals. (IV.C.5)

Board Policies (2010, 2210, 2200, and 2410) outline the size, duties, responsibilities, operating procedures, and structure of the Board, of which all are available on the College's website and through BoardDocs. (IV.C.6)

Interviews with three of the Board members and Board meeting agendas/minutes demonstrate that Board actions are consistent with its policies and procedures. Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 2410 defines Board Policies and Administrative Procedures. Evidence and interviews indicate that the College subscribes to biannual policy and procedure updates from the Community College League of California to guide policy review. Board policy dictates that Board Policies and Administrative Procedures are maintained through a systematic three-year review and evaluation; however, there appears to be some inconsistencies in the adherence to this policy. The Board Policy and Administrative Procedures documented on BoardDocs reflect a 2015 review/approval on most, if not all the policies and procedures. After further investigation, the College provided a separate spreadsheet outlining the administrative review timelines and approval. It appears the College has made a concerted effort to update and review most of the Board Policies and Administrative Procedures in December 2018. (IV.C.7)

The Board regularly requests and reviews reports on student achievement data and metrics to fulfill their responsibility to monitor institutional performance and educational quality. Interviews concluded that the Board regularly reviews the annual CCCCO Student Success Scorecard, Student Equity data, the new Student Success metrics, Guided Pathways, and other programmatic presentations that feature success and retention data. Additionally, the Board has established objectives specific to student success and reviews the Strategic Educational Master Plan and Student Equity Plan. (IV.C.8)

Board Policy 2740 defines the regular and ongoing professional development and training that the Board is required to undertake to enhance Board effectiveness in governance. Training includes attending at least one conference per year, receiving updates to the CCLC Trustees Handbook, attending a board retreat at least once a year, and reviewing materials and engaging in study sessions. New board members are provided with a comprehensive orientation conducted by the President/Superintendent. Board Policy 2100 stipulates that Board terms are staggered to promote continuity of leadership. (IV.C.9)

The Board has an established annual process of self-evaluation and goal setting defined in Board Policy 2745. The Board regularly evaluates its practices and performance, including full participation in board training and making the results public during Board meetings and on the website. (IV.C.10)

Board Policy 2710 and 2715 outlines the Board's policy expectations as they relate to Conflicts of Interest and Code of Ethics, including actions to be taken in the event of a breach of ethical behavior. Based on review of the evidence, the Board adheres to each of the policies that establish ethical practices and behavior. It appears based on interviews with Board members that there are no issues concerning conduct of members of the governing board. (IV.C.11) The Board has delegated operational authority to the CEO (BP 2430) and uses the annual CEO evaluation to set clear expectations for his reporting on institutional performance. The evaluation team determined that the President/Superintendent's annual evaluation is currently in progress and is slated for completion by April 2019. (IV.C.12)

The team confirmed that College staff kept the Board well informed regarding Accreditation Standards and Eligibility Requirements, as well as regularly updating the Board during the preparation for reaffirmation of accreditation process. The formation of the CART was an intentional response for the need to keep accreditation at the forefront of all College planning. Board members were engaged in accreditation work sessions and training workshops, participated in development of the current ISER, and approve all ACCJC Annual Reports, Annual Fiscal Reports, and institutional reports (IV.C.13)

The team recognizes and applauds the Board of Trustees for their passion and dedication to serving the college and their community. The Board is aware of their appropriate role in developing policy, yet takes an active role in knowing and understanding the issues on a national, state and local level through active pursuit of professional development, as well as the data related to the college, in an effort to make decisions that are in the best interest of the students and the college.

**Conclusion:** The College meets the Standards and Eligibility Requirements.

# **Quality Focus Essay**

The Imperial Valley College Quality Focus Essay prioritizes key activities and related goals aimed at planning and implementing a Guided Pathways framework at the institution. The QFE establishes initial courses of action directed at addressing the barriers to student success, specifically as it relates to completion rates of transfer level math, English, ESL, and attainment of degrees, certificates, or transfer-related outcomes.

The core QFE activities relate to the following goals:

- Goal 1: Create clear curricular pathways to employment and further education
- Goal 2: Help students choose and enter their pathway
  - Goal 2.1: Develop appropriate Meta Majors to address interests and goals of local students
  - o Goal 2.2: Streamline general education course offerings
- Goal 3: Help students stay on their path
  - o Goal 3.1: Increase the percentage of Basic Skills students who successfully complete a transfer level English course within one calendar year
  - Goal 3.2: Increase the percentage of Basic Skills students who successfully complete a degree-applicable Mathematics course within one calendar year
  - O Goal 3.3: Increase the percentage of ESL students who complete a transfer-level course
  - o Goal 3.4: Increase students' educational goal completion (degrees, certificates, or transfer)
  - Goal 3.5: Increase the number of employees receiving professional development in areas that directly impact and are aligned with the Guided Pathways implementation at Imperial Valley College
- Goal 4: Ensure that learning is happening with intentional outcomes

The QFE establishes appropriate, adequate, and complementary courses of action to address each of the goals. The QFE appears to be ambitious and thoroughly supported by the institution's constituencies and participatory governance groups. Responsible groups are identified with corresponding timelines. Although goals are clearly defined within the QFE, there are no milestones and/or benchmarks identified to monitor both informative and summative progress.

The team encourages IVC to establish current baselines for all measures and identify indicators of progress to assist with evaluation and assessment efforts.